

# Comparison between Lithium Substitution and Doping on the Physical and Piezoelectric Properties of Lead-Free BCZT Ceramics

Haziqah Fadhlina Md Hussain<sup>1</sup>, Atiqah Mohd Afdzaluddin<sup>1,\*</sup>, Zalita Zainuddin<sup>2</sup>, M.N.M. Ansari<sup>3</sup>, S. Jeyanthi<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Institute of Microengineering and Nanoelectronics, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, 43600 UKM Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia

<sup>2</sup> Department of Applied Physics, Faculty of Science and Technology, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, 43600 UKM Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia

<sup>3</sup> Institute of Power Engineering, Universiti Tenaga Nasional, 43000 Kajang, Selangor, Malaysia

<sup>4</sup> School of Mechanical Engineering, Vellore Institute of Technology, Chennai 600127, Tamil Nadu, India

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
<b>Article history:</b> Received 4 July 2023 Received in revised form 6 September 2023 Accepted 22 September 2023 Available online 31 October 2023	Defects generation in ceramics by element substitution or doping may improve their properties. However, different results will be obtained even though the same element is involved due to different mechanisms. Ceramics $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15}Ti_{0.9}Zr_{0.1}O_3$ (BCZT) is one of the potential candidates to replace lead-based material PZT. However, the conventional method requires high-temperature calcination and sintering process to synthesize this material. Thus, Lithium (Li) can act as the sintering aid to lower the temperature at the same time, the properties of piezoelectric can be enhanced. In this paper, the structural, physical, and piezoelectric performance of lead-free $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15}Ti_{0.9}Zr_{0.1}O_3$ (BCZT) ceramics with Lithium Li substitution and doping, synthesized by the solid-state reaction method were studied. The substitution of Li increases the density, $\rho$ and piezoelectric coefficient, $d_{33}$ of BCZT which are 4.075 g/cm <sup>3</sup> and 304.6 pC/N, respectively. These results demonstrate that Li substitution is more beneficial to the piezoelectric stand doping because it produces birder grain
Keywords:	boundary resistance and activation energy and has lower conductivity than doping.
Ba <sub>0.85</sub> Ca <sub>0.15</sub> Ti <sub>0.9</sub> Zr <sub>0.1</sub> O <sub>3</sub> ceramics; lithium- BCZT; density; piezoelectric properties	This can provide a definite strategy during the chemical composition design and manufacture of BCZT ceramics.

#### 1. Introduction

Since 1990 lead-free piezoelectric materials have been intensively studied due to the material's ability as an energy resource. On top of that, they can be used as an initiative to replace the most popular lead-based piezoelectric material, Lead Zirconate Titanate (PZT), which has dominated the current piezoelectric ceramics field since the 1950s. PZT is an ABO<sub>3</sub> perovskite structure material with good performance of piezoelectric coefficient ( $d_{33}$ ,  $d_{31} \sim 370$  pC/N), electromechanical coupling factor (kp, kt ~ 60%), ferroelectric properties and dielectric properties [1–3]. However, the high-level toxicity (> 60 wt%) produced by this lead-based material during the preparation process (fabrication,

\* Corresponding author.

https://doi.org/10.37934/aram.111.1.915

*E-mail address: a.atiqah@ukm.edu.my* 

calcination and sintering) causes environmental problems and climate change. These phenomena have been subjects of environmental concern since 19<sup>th</sup> century and can lead to the greenhouse effect and also global warming. This problems to the human health resulting in sickness and fatalities [4–9]. Piezoelectricity is the ability of certain materials to generate an electrical current when applied with mechanical stress or vice versa [10]. Piezoelectric materials have been used in various applications, such as in communication systems, medical instruments, and electronic devices like buzzers, actuators, transducers, resonators, microphones and optoelectronics [11–13].

Lead-free Barium Calcium Zirconate Titanate (BCZT) is one of the most promising candidates that has drawn attention since the past decade due to its good performance of electrical properties. BCZT is a Barium Titanate (BT) based ceramic with Calcium (Ca) ion and Zirconium ion (Zr) substitution at the A-site and B-site, respectively [14]. This material exhibits a high piezoelectric coefficient ( $d_{33} \sim 300 - 650 \text{ pC/N}$ ) due to the shifting of the orthorhombic-tetragonal (TO-T) temperature towards ambient temperature that is called the polymorphic phase transition (PPT) [15–18]. It also has good electromechanical coupling coefficient, kP, dielectric constant and ferroelectric properties with large remnant polarization, Pr and low coercive field. However, its low Curie temperature (Tc ~ 83-100 °C) is the drawback for this material [18–21].

Some researchers reported that the properties of BCZT can be improved by doping it with a specific compound. Adding a suitable amount of low-temperature melting additives such as Lithium (LiF and LiCO<sub>3</sub>) could lower the sintering temperature [22]. This sintering aids not only reduces the sintering temperature but could also enhance the crystallization of material even in low calcination temperatures [23, 24]. However, in some cases, the piezoelectric properties may be decreased due to the existence of a secondary phase due to the addition of these sintering aids [22]. Thus, this study will use the Li element to substitute at the Ca site in the BCZT ceramics materials. The structural, physical, and electrical properties will be determined and compared with the Li-doped BCZT ceramics results.

## 2. Methodology

A conventional solid-state reaction method was used to prepare Ba<sub>0.85</sub>Ca<sub>0.15-x</sub>Li<sub>x</sub>Zr<sub>0.1</sub>Ti<sub>0.9</sub>O<sub>3</sub> with x = 0.00 and 0.06. The starting raw materials were barium carbonate, BaCO<sub>3</sub>, calcium carbonate, CaCO<sub>3</sub>, titanium oxide, TiO<sub>2</sub>, zirconium oxide, ZrO<sub>2</sub> and lithium carbonate, LiCO<sub>3</sub>. The sample preparation by using solid-state reaction is shown in Figure 1. The raw powder materials were weighed according to stoichiometry and ball milled using zirconia balls for 24 hours at 250 rpm in ethanol. Then the mixture was dried for 2 hours at 150 °C and calcined at 1000 °C for 4 hours. Afterwards, the powder was ground manually using mortar before being compacted into pellets using a hydraulic press. All samples were sintered at 1350 °C for 2 hours. The phase and structure of the ceramics was determined using an X-ray diffractometer, XRD (Bruker D8 Advance), with CuK $\alpha$  radiation in 20 range from 20° to 80°. The samples' morphology and microstructure were observed using field emission scanning electron microscope (FESEM, Zeiss Supra 55VP). The density of the materials was measured in silicon oil using Archimedes' principle. For the electrical properties study, the flat surfaces of the pellets were polished and coated with silver electrodes. The samples were poled at 60 °C in silicon oil by applying an electric field of 2.5 kV/mm for 10 minutes for the piezoelectric properties determination.



Fig. 1. The solid-state reaction process of  $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15}$   $_xLi_xZr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$  material

## 3. Results and Discussion

### 3.1 Structure and Phase

The X-ray diffraction (XRD) patterns of  $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15-x}Li_xZr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$  (x = 0.00 and x = 0.06) ceramics in Figure 2 exhibit perovskite structure based on the International Centre for Diffraction Data (ICDD). Based on Figure 2 (b), the peak position moved to the lower angle diffraction with Li substitution, showing the lattice parameter increment. The Li substituted sample (x = 0.06) also shows no secondary phase formed, as shown in BCZT with x = 0.00.





Fig. 2. The XRD patterns of (a)  $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15-x}Li_{2x}Zr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$  for x = 0.00 and x = 0.06 and (b) enlarged region at 20 between 44.5° and 46°

## 3.2 Morphology

Figure 3 shows the morphology images of  $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15-x}Li_xZr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$  when x = 0.00 and x = 0.06. BCZT, when x = 0.06, looks denser than without the substitution of Li (x = 0.00). Fewer pores existed, and the grain size was larger than when x = 0.00. This is due to the formation of a liquid phase during sintering, which helped the grain growth.



**Fig. 3**. The SEM images of The XRD patterns of (a)  $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15-x}Li_{2x}Zr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$  when (a) x = 0.00 and (b) x = 0.06

## 3.3 Density

Archimedes' principle was used to obtain the density of the samples in pellet form. Table 1 below shows the density value when Li is substituted or doped into BCZT materials. In this research, the substitution of Li with x = 0.06 shows a higher density than BCZT with x = 0.00 due to increasing grain size that lessens the pore size. Even though the density value of the samples synthesized using the substitution method is lower than other research using the doping method, it shows that the density can be increased and potentially give a higher value by a particular method.

### Table 1

The density of Li substitution on  $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15-x}Li_{2x}Zr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$  and Li doped on  $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15-x}Zr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$ 

Materials	Substitution/doping (preparation method)	Density, ρ (g/cm³)	References
Ba <sub>0.85</sub> Ca <sub>0.15-x</sub> Li <sub>2x</sub> Zr <sub>0.1</sub> Ti <sub>0.9</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (x = 0.00)	Without substitution	2.624	This research
Ba <sub>0.85</sub> Ca <sub>0.15-x</sub> Li <sub>2x</sub> Zr <sub>0.1</sub> Ti <sub>0.9</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (x = 0.06)	Substitution (SSR)	4.075	This research
Ba <sub>0.85</sub> Ca <sub>0.15</sub> Zr <sub>0.1</sub> Ti <sub>0.9</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (BCZT) – 0.5 wt% LiCO <sub>3</sub>	Doping (Sol-gel)	5.8651	[25]
Ba0.85Ca0.15Zr0.1Ti0.9O3 (BCZT) – 1 wt% LiCO3	Doping (Citrate method)	5.7957	[26]

## 3.4 Piezoelectric Properties, d<sub>33</sub>

Piezoelectric coefficient,  $d_{33}$  is the charge generated in the direction of the z-axis when mechanical stress was applied in the same direction, which is z-axis. Table 2 below shows the result of  $d_{33}$  in different methods of the substitution/doping of Li into BCZT materials. In this research, the substitution of Li with x = 0.06 shows the increment of the piezoelectric coefficient,  $d_{33}$ . This may be affected by the increasing density of the sample.

### Table 2

The  $d_{33}$  of Li substitution on  $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15\text{-}x}Li_{2x}Zr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$  and Li doped on  $Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15\text{-}x}Zr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$ 

Materials	Substitution/doping (preparation method)	Piezoelectric coefficient, d <sub>33</sub> (pC/N)	References
Ba <sub>0.85</sub> Ca <sub>0.15-x</sub> Li <sub>x</sub> Zr <sub>0.1</sub> Ti <sub>0.9</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (x = 0.00)	Without substitution	122	This research
$Ba_{0.85}Ca_{0.15-x}Li_xZr_{0.1}Ti_{0.9}O_3$ (x = 0.06)	Substitution (SSR)	304	This research
Ba <sub>0.85</sub> Ca <sub>0.15</sub> Zr <sub>0.1</sub> Ti <sub>0.9</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (BCZT) – 0.5 wt% LiCO <sub>3</sub>	Doping (Sol-gel)	447	[25]
Ba <sub>0.85</sub> Ca <sub>0.15</sub> Zr <sub>0.1</sub> Ti <sub>0.9</sub> O <sub>3</sub> (BCZT) – 1 wt% LiCO <sub>3</sub>	Doping (Citrate method)	336	[27]
Ba <sub>0.85</sub> Ca <sub>0.15</sub> Ti <sub>0.9</sub> Zr <sub>0.1</sub> O <sub>3</sub> + 0.3 wt.% Li <sub>2</sub> CO <sub>3</sub>	Doping (SSR)	512	[28]

## 4. Conclusions

This research studied the substitution of Lithium in Ba<sub>0.85</sub>Ca<sub>0.15</sub>Ti<sub>0.9</sub>Zr<sub>0.1</sub>O<sub>3</sub> materials on the structure, morphology, density, and piezoelectric properties, d<sub>33</sub>. The substitution of Lithium can improve the physical and electrical properties of  $\rho = 4.075$  g/cm<sup>3</sup> and d<sub>33</sub> = 304.6 pC/N compared to Li dopant in lead-free BCZT ceramic materials.

#### Acknowledgement

Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia funded this research under the GGPM 2020-036 grant.

#### References

- [1] Ma, Jian, Juan Wu, Bo Wu, and Wenjuan Wu. "Advances in the modification of the contradictory relationship between piezoelectricity and Curie temperature: simultaneous realization of large piezoelectricity and high Curie temperature in potassium sodium niobate-based ferroelectrics." *Journal of Materials Chemistry C* 8, no. 28 (2020): 9506-9510. <u>https://doi.org/10.1039/D0TC01888K</u>
- [2] Li, Peng, Zhengqian Fu, Feifei Wang, Yu Huan, Zhiyong Zhou, Jiwei Zhai, Bo Shen, and Shujun Zhang. "High piezoelectricity and stable output in BaHfO3 and (Bi0. 5Na0. 5) ZrO3 modified (K0. 5Na0. 5)(Nb0. 96Sb0. 04) O3 textured ceramics." *Acta Materialia* 199 (2020): 542-550. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.actamat.2020.08.058</u>
- [3] Kaleva, G. M., E. D. Politova, A. V. Mosunov, and S. Yu Stefanovich. "Phase formation, structure, and dielectric properties of modified potassium sodium niobate ceramics." *Inorganic Materials* 56 (2020): 1072-1078. <u>https://doi.org/10.1134/S0020168520100076</u>
- [4] Cheng, Yuan, Jie Xing, Chao Wu, Ting Wang, Lixu Xie, Yixuan Liu, Xingyu Xu, Ke Wang, Dingquan Xiao, and Jianguo Zhu. "Investigation of high piezoelectric properties of KNNSb-SrxBNZ ceramics." *Journal of Alloys and Compounds* 815 (2020): 152252. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2019.152252</u>
- [5] Kumar, Satyam, Rajnish Kurchania, and Ashok Kumar. "Dielectric and impedance spectroscopic study of lithium doped potassium tantalum niobium oxide." *Ceramics International* 45, no. 14 (2019): 17137-17143. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ceramint.2019.05.267</u>
- [6] He, Xiafeng, Feifei Han, Min Liu, Zhi Yuan, Xinyu Jiang, Changzheng Hu, Shaokai Ren, Xiuyun Lei, and Laijun Liu. "High-temperature dielectric and relaxation behavior of tantalum-doped sodium bismuth titanate-barium titanate ceramics." *Journal of Electronic Materials* 49 (2020): 6643-6655. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s11664-020-08441-y</u>
- [7] Benyoussef, Manal, Moneim Zannen, Jamal Belhadi, Bouchaib Manoun, Jean-Luc Dellis, Mimoun El Marssi, and Abdelilah Lahmar. "Dielectric, ferroelectric, and energy storage properties in dysprosium doped sodium bismuth titanate ceramics." *Ceramics International* 44, no. 16 (2018): 19451-19460. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ceramint.2018.07.182
- [8] Ha, Chin Yee, Terh Jing Khoo, and Zheng Yik Koo. "Current status of green building development in Malaysia." *Progress in Energy and Environment* (2023): 1-9. <u>https://doi.org/10.37934/progee.25.1.19</u>
- [9] Sulaiman, Nabila, Sany Izan Ihsan, Syed Noh Syed Abu Bakar, Zafri Azran Abdul Majid, and Zairul Azrul Zakaria. "Evacuated tubes solar air collectors: A review on design configurations, simulation works and applications." *Progress in Energy and Environment* (2023): 10-32. <u>https://doi.org/10.37934/progee.25.1.1032</u>
- [10] Fadhlina, Haziqah, A. Atiqah, and Zalita Zainuddin. "A Review on Lithium Doped Lead-Free Piezoelectric Material." *Materials Today Communications* (2022): 104835. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mtcomm.2022.104835</u>
- [11] Yan, Xiaodong, Mupeng Zheng, Mankang Zhu, and Yudong Hou. "Enhanced electrical resistivity and mechanical properties in BCTZ-based composite ceramic." *Journal of Advanced Dielectrics* 9, no. 05 (2019): 1950036. <u>https://doi.org/10.1142/S2010135X1950036X</u>
- [12] Jiang, Minhong, Jingwei Zhang, Guanghui Rao, Dedong Li, Clive A. Randall, Tao Li, BiaoLin Peng et al. "Ultrahigh piezoelectric coefficient of a lead-free K 0.5 Na 0.5 NbO 3-based single crystal fabricated by a simple seed-free solidstate growth method." *Journal of Materials Chemistry C* 7, no. 47 (2019): 14845-14854. https://doi.org/10.1039/C9TC05143K
- [13] Perumal, Rajesh Narayana, Venkatraj Athikesavan, and Prita Nair. "Influence of lead titanate additive on the structural and electrical properties of Na0. 5Bi0. 5TiO3-SrTiO3 piezoelectric ceramics." *Ceramics International* 44, no. 11 (2018): 13259-13266. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ceramint.2018.04.155</u>
- [14] Bansal, Pankhuri, Manoj Kumar, Rajat Syal, Arun Kumar Singh, and Sanjeev Kumar. "Magnetoelectric coupling enhancement in lead-free BCTZ–x NZFO composites." *Journal of Materials Science: Materials in Electronics* 32, no. 13 (2021): 17512-17523. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10854-021-06284-9</u>

- [15] Kornphom, Chittakorn, Thanya Udeye, Prasit Thongbai, and Theerachai Bongkarn. "Phase structures, PPT region and electrical properties of new lead-free KNLNTS-BCTZ ceramics fabricated via the solid-state combustion technique." *Ceramics International* 43 (2017): S182-S192. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ceramint.2017.05.180</u>
- [16] Chen, Xiaoming, Jiangtao Zeng, Dokyun Kim, Liaoying Zheng, Qiwei Lou, Chul Hong Park, and Guorong Li. "Understanding of role of Li in high-performance Pb-free Li-doped (Ba0. 85 Ca0. 15)(Ti0. 9 Zr0. 1) O3 piezoceramics from theory and experiments." *Materials Chemistry and Physics* 231 (2019): 173-180. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matchemphys.2019.04.011
- [17] Tan, Chee Kiang Ivan, Kui Yao, and Jan Ma. "Effects of LiF on the Structure and Properties of Ba 0.85 Ca 0.15 Zr 0.1 Ti 0.9 O3 Lead-Free Piezoelectric Ceramics." *International Journal of Applied Ceramic Technology* 10, no. 4 (2013): 701-706. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-7402.2012.02771.x</u>
- [18] Awan, Muhammad Qadeer, Javed Ahmad, Qingbo Sun, Wanbiao Hu, Adam Berlie, and Yun Liu. "Structure, dielectric and ferroelectric properties of lead-free (Ba, Ca)(Ti, Zr) O3-xBiErO3 piezoelectric ceramics." *Ceramics International* 44, no. 6 (2018): 6872-6877. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ceramint.2018.01.112</u>
- [19] Wu, Yinghong, Fei Ma, Jingkui Qu, Yang Luo, Jing Song, Guangye Wei, Yingchun Zhang, and Tao Qi. "Role of Cu and Y in sintering, phase transition, and electrical properties of BCZT lead-free piezoceramics." *Ceramics International* 44, no. 13 (2018): 15001-15009. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ceramint.2018.05.129</u>
- [20] Xu, Jie, Yang Zhou, Zihao Li, Cong Lin, Xinghua Zheng, Tengfei Lin, Xiao Wu, and Feifei Wang. "Microstructural, ferroelectric and photoluminescence properties of Er3+-doped Ba0. 85Ca0. 15Ti0. 9Zr0. 1O3 thin films." *Materials Chemistry and Physics* 262 (2021): 124320. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matchemphys.2021.124320</u>
- [21] Orlik, Kelly, Yannick Lorgouilloux, Pascal Marchet, Anthony Thuault, Florian Jean, Mohamed Rguiti, and Christian Courtois. "Influence of microwave sintering on electrical properties of BCTZ lead free piezoelectric ceramics." *Journal of the European Ceramic Society* 40, no. 4 (2020): 1212-1216. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeurceramsoc.2019.12.010</u>
- [22] Gio, P. D., and N. D. Phong. "Effects of LiF on the Structure and Electrical Properties of (Na 0.52 K 0.435 Li 0.045) Nb 0.87 Sb 0.08 Ta 0.05 O 3 Lead-Free Piezoelectric Ceramics Sintered at Low Temperatures." *Journal of Materials Science and Chemical Engineering* 3, no. 11 (2015): 13. <u>https://doi.org/10.4236/msce.2015.311003</u>
- [23] UI, Rémy, Pascal Marchet, Mai Pham-Thi, and Louis-Pascal Tran-Huu-Hue. "Improved properties of doped BaTiO3 piezoelectric ceramics." *physica status solidi (a)* 216, no. 22 (2019): 1900413. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/pssa.201900413</u>
- [24] Hwang, Chuan Chou, Chen Chia Chou, Jyh Liang Wang, Tsang Yen Hsieh, and Jui Te Tseng. "The Lithium Doping Effect on (Na0. 5K0. 5) NbO3 Lead-Free Piezo-ceramics Structure Stability and Ferroelectric Characteristics." *Applied Mechanics and Materials* 217 (2012): 682-685. <u>https://doi.org/10.4028/www.scientific.net/AMM.217-219.682</u>
- [25] Nan, Bo, Aleš Matoušek, Pavel Tofel, Vijay Bijalwan, Tim Button, Lisong Li, Pengyuan Fan, and Haibo Zhang. "Effect of lithium carbonate on the sintering, microstructure, and functional properties of sol–gel-derived Ba0. 85Ca0. 15Zr0. 1Ti0. 9O3 piezoceramics." *Journal of Materials Research* 36 (2021): 1105-1113. <u>https://doi.org/10.1557/jmr.2020.238</u>
- [26] Liu, Xing, Zhihui Chen, Dun Wu, Bijun Fang, Jianning Ding, Xiangyong Zhao, Haiqing Xu, and Haosu Luo. "Enhancing pyroelectric properties of Li-doped (Ba0. 85Ca0. 15)(Zr0. 1Ti0. 9) O3 lead-free ceramics by optimizing calcination temperature." *Japanese Journal of Applied Physics* 54, no. 7 (2015): 071501. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeurceramsoc.2011.04.023
- [27] Liu, Xing, Min Zhu, Zhihui Chen, Bijun Fang, Jianning Ding, Xiangyong Zhao, Haiqing Xu, and Haosu Luo. "Structure and electrical properties of Li-doped BaTiO3–CaTiO3–BaZrO3 lead-free ceramics prepared by citrate method." *Journal of alloys and compounds* 613 (2014): 219-225. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2014.06.046</u>
- [28] Chen, Xiaoming, Xuezheng Ruan, Kunyun Zhao, Xueqing He, Jiangtao Zeng, Yongsheng Li, Liaoying Zheng, Chul Hong Park, and Guorong Li. "Low sintering temperature and high piezoelectric properties of Li-doped (Ba, Ca)(Ti, Zr) O3 lead-free ceramics." *Journal of Alloys and Compounds* 632 (2015): 103-109. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2015.01.088</u>